

CONCLUSION AND SUMMARY

In this thesis, I have tried to show that analyticity is a sufficient condition for determinate radical translation; and that determinate radical translation is a necessary condition for analyticity. This is why some of the main arguments in support of analyticity made appeal to some such notion as "sameness of meaning".

In this thesis I have tried to show that a good case against radical determinate translation and its attendant corollaries which invoke the notion of sameness of meaning will be of great concern to all those supporters of the analytic-synthetic distinction who make appeal to any such intuitive notions of sameness of meaning. I hope that Chapter II has shown that if Quine hasn't "disproved" those intuitive accounts of translation, at least he has made a good case: he has presented an alternative theory for consideration as well as a pragmatic guideline to be used in the theory selection process.

The pragmatic guideline-Quine's theory of truth - was not, of course, the main topic of this thesis. Rather, this thesis is largely an exposition of Quine's theory of meaning. I hope that section 6 was an adequate summary of Quine's theory of truth, because it is on the strength of his theory of truth that Quine builds his case against determinate radical translation and therefore analyticity.

There are, moreover, several lines of arguments against the notion of analyticity in its own right, as I tried to show in Chapter I. Given the whole of Quine's epistemology as a starting point (i.e., both his theory of meaning as well as his theory of truth) the notion of analyticity and its implications becomes an obstacle because certain of its intuitive presuppositions commit us to impractical explanations. Of course, the best argument against the distinction is the traditional empirical argument: we have no experience of such a distinction. Rather, the distinction was raised as a way of explaining the process of knowledge. As an explanatory theory, the analytic-synthetic distinction seems to carry some ontological commitments which Quine is not willing to admit because of lack of evidence. The ontological commitment which lacks evidential support is a commitment to meanings as extra-linguistic and extra-theoretical entities. Meaning is not something that can be had, shared or changed. Rather, meaning is the possibility of certain dispositions to behavior. Moreover, the distinction, independent of any ontological commitments, is vague enough to have resisted persistent efforts to explain it conveniently and coherently.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books:

- Ayer, A. J. Language, Truth, and Logic. Middlesex: Penguin Co., 1946.
- Ayer, A. J. Some Central Questions of Philosophy. Middlesex: Penguin Co., 1973.
- Carnap, Rudolf. "Empiricism, Semantics, and Ontology."
In Philosophy of Mathematics. Edited by Benacerraf and Putnam. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, 1964.
- Davidson, Donald, and Hintikka, Jaakko, eds. Words and Objections. Dordrecht, Holland: Reidel, 1969.
- Grice, H.F., and Strawson, P.F. "In Defense of a Dogma."
In Analyticity. pp. 56 - 57. Edited by James F. Harris and Richard H. Severens. Chicago: Quadrangle Books, 1970.
- Hume, David. A Treatise on Human Nature. D. G. C. Macnabb, editor. London : Fontana, 1962.
- Kant, Immanuel. Critique of Pure Reason. Translated by J. M. D. Meiklejohn. New York, 1969.
- Koner, S. Kant. Middlesex : Penguin Co., 1955.
- Leibniz, Gottfried. Leibniz: Philosophical Writings. Translated by G. H. R. Parkinson. London: Fontana, 1973.

Passmore, Joh. A Hundred Years of Philosophy. Middlessex: Penguin Co., 1968.

Quine, W. V. O. From A Logical Point of View. New York : Harper Torchbooks, 1963.

_____. Ontological Relativity. New York: Columbia University Press, 1969.

_____. Philosophy of Logic, Englewood Cliffs, N.J. : Prentice-Hall, 1970.

_____. The Roots of Reference. La Salle: Open Court, 1973.

_____. The Ways of Paradox, Cambridge, Mass. : Harvard University Press, 1976.

_____. Word and Object. Cambridge, Mass.: The M. I. T. Press, 1960.

Quine, W. V. O., and Ullian, J. J. Web of Belief. New York : Random House, 1970.

Wilson, Edward, O. On Human Nature. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1978.

Articles:

Dechert, Marian. "Quine, Strawson and Logical Truth."
Philosophical Studies. 24 (1973).

Haas, W. "The Theory of Translation." Philosophy. 37
(1962): 208 - 228.

Harman, Gilbert. "Quine on Meaning and Existence, I." Review of Metaphysics. XXI, 1 (September 1967).

Kirk, R. "Underdetermination of Theory and Indeterminacy of Translation." Analysis. 33, 6 (June 1973).

Putnam, Hilary. "The Analytic and the Synthetic." Minnesota Studies in the Philosophy of Science, III (1969).

Quine, W. V. O. "On the Reasons for Indeterminacy of Translation." The Journal of Philosophy. LXVII (1970).

_____. "Philosophical Progress in Language Theory." Metaphilosophy 1, 1 (January 1970).

_____. Review of Identity and Individuation. Edited by Milton K. Munitz. The Journal of Philosophy LXIX, 16 (1972).

Schuldenfrei, Richard. "Quine in Perspective." The Journal of Philosophy. LXIX, 1 (1972).

Shirley, Edward, S. "Putnam of Analyticity." Philosophical Studies 24, 4 (July 1973).

Young, Julian. "Rabbits." Philosophical Studies. 23 (1972): 170 - 185.

Presley, C. F. "Willard Van Orman Quine." Encyclopedia of Philosophy Collier-Macmillan & (1967).

Walsh, W. H. "Immanuel Kant." Encyclopedia of Philosophy Collier-Macmillan 4 (1967).

Other:

W. V. O. Quine. Professor of Philosophy (retired). Department of Philosophy, Harvard University. Private Conversation, 22 November 1978.



ศูนย์วิจัยทรัพยากร
จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

Curriculum Vitae

- Mister Stephen R. Schmidt
- Date and place of birth: 29 September 1945, Washington, D.C.
- Education: B. A., Philosophy and Religion from St. John's Seminary College, Brighton, Massachusetts, 1967
Entered Department of Philosophy, Graduate School, Chulalongkorn University, 1974
- Experience: English Teacher: Chiangmai University: 1972-74.
Philosophy Teacher: Thammasat University: 1976-77.
Philosophy Teacher: Chiangmai University:
1977 to present.

ศูนย์วิทยทรัพยากร
จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย